

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-10084-RA**

Ramaci v. Federal Bureau Of Investigation  
Assigned to: Judge Ronnie Abrams  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 12/26/2017  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff****Lisa Ramaci**

represented by **Michael Jacob Radine**  
Osen LLP  
Two University Plaza, Suite 402  
Hackensack, NJ 07601  
201-265-6400  
Fax: 201-265-0303  
Email: [mradine@osenlaw.com](mailto:mradine@osenlaw.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**William Adam Friedman**  
Osen LLP  
Two University Plaza, Suite 400  
Hackensack, NJ 07601  
(201)-265-6400  
Fax: (201)-265-0303  
Email: [wfriedman@osenlaw.com](mailto:wfriedman@osenlaw.com)  
*TERMINATED: 07/08/2019*

V.

**Defendant****Federal Bureau Of Investigation**

represented by **Andrew Edward Krause**  
United States Attorney's Office, SDNY  
86 Chambers Street, 3rd Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 637-2769  
Fax: (212) 637-2786  
Email: [andrew.krause@usdoj.gov](mailto:andrew.krause@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Natasha Waglow Teleanu**  
United States Attorney's Office, SDNY  
86 Chambers Street, 3rd fl.  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2528  
Fax: 212-637-2786  
Email: [natasha.teleanu@usdoj.gov](mailto:natasha.teleanu@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/26/2017	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Federal Bureau Of Investigation. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 0208-14514218) Document filed by Lisa Ramaci.(Friedman, William) (Entered: 12/26/2017)
12/26/2017	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Friedman, William) (Entered: 12/26/2017)

12/26/2017	<u>3</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to Federal Bureau of Investigation, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Friedman, William) Modified on 12/27/2017 (jgo). (Entered: 12/26/2017)
12/26/2017	<u>4</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DUPLICATE DOCKET ENTRY – COMPLAINT</b> against Federal Bureau Of Investigation. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L)(Friedman, William) Modified on 12/27/2017 (jgo). (Entered: 12/26/2017)
12/27/2017		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT PLEADING.</b> Notice to Attorney William Adam Friedman regarding Document No. <u>4</u> Complaint. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): Docket #1 has been accepted as the Initial Pleading moving forward. If you wish to file the exhibits with the complaint, you could either file an Amended Complaint or file a Corrected Complaint with permission from the Judge assigned to your case. (jgo) Modified on 12/27/2017 (jgo). (Entered: 12/27/2017)
12/27/2017		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Ronnie Abrams. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php</a> . (jgo) (Entered: 12/27/2017)
12/27/2017		Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php</a> . (jgo) (Entered: 12/27/2017)
12/27/2017		Case Designated ECF. (jgo) (Entered: 12/27/2017)
12/27/2017		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS.</b> Notice to Attorney William Adam Friedman to RE–FILE Document No. <u>3</u> Request for Issuance of Summons. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): Caption title is incorrect. Re–file the document using the event type Request for Issuance of Summons found under the event list Service of Process – select the correct filer/filers – and attach the correct summons form PDF. (jgo) (Entered: 12/27/2017)
12/27/2017	<u>5</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint against Federal Bureau Of Investigation.Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L)(Friedman, William) (Entered: 12/27/2017)
12/27/2017	<u>6</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Federal Bureau of Investigation, re: <u>5</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Friedman, William) (Entered: 12/27/2017)
12/28/2017	<u>7</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Federal Bureau Of Investigation. (pc) (Entered: 12/28/2017)
01/12/2018	<u>8</u>	ORDER AND NOTICE OF INITIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Conference set for 3/1/2018 at 3:30 PM in Courtroom 1506, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Ronnie Abrams, and as further set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 1/12/2018) (ap) (Entered: 01/12/2018)
01/16/2018	<u>9</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Natasha Waglow Teleanu on behalf of Federal Bureau Of Investigation. (Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 01/16/2018)
01/16/2018	<u>10</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Order and Notice of Initial Conference dated January 12, 2018 (ECF No. 8) served on Federal Bureau of Investigation on January 16, 2018. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Friedman, William) (Entered: 01/16/2018)

01/16/2018	<u>11</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Michael Jacob Radine on behalf of Lisa Ramaci. (Radine, Michael) (Entered: 01/16/2018)
02/01/2018	<u>12</u>	ANSWER to <u>5</u> Amended Complaint., Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 02/01/2018)
02/23/2018	<u>13</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 2/23/2018 re: pursuant to Court's 1/12/2018 Order. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 02/23/2018)
03/01/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ronnie Abrams: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 3/1/2018. (arc) (Entered: 03/01/2018)
03/01/2018	<u>14</u>	ORDER. The parties shall submit a joint letter to the Court no later than March 30, 2018, updating the Court on the status of the case and, if possible, proposing a time line for the production of any additional documents. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 3/1/2018) (rjm) (Entered: 03/02/2018)
03/30/2018	<u>15</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Natasha Teleanu and William Friedman dated 3/30/2018 re: status updates and proposed briefing schedule. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 03/30/2018)
04/03/2018	<u>16</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>15</u> Letter regarding status updates and proposed briefing schedule filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The parties shall submit their status report no later than May 4, 2018. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 4/3/2018) (rj) (Entered: 04/04/2018)
05/04/2018	<u>17</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from William Friedman and Natasha Teleanu dated May 4, 2018 re: Status Report. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci.(Friedman, William) (Entered: 05/04/2018)
05/07/2018	<u>18</u>	ORDER: Although the Court is sympathetic to Plaintiff's desire to obtain the relevant documents to which she claims she is entitled as quickly as possible, summary-judgment briefing is premature at this time. There are still thousands of pages of documents that the FBI has agreed to review and process between now and December 2018. Although Plaintiff describes the issue with regard to the (b)(7)(D) redactions as "discrete," it appears likely that related but distinct issues will continue to arise throughout the course of the remaining production. At present, it would be inefficient for both the parties and the Court to address Plaintiff's objection. When the Court has a more complete record, it will be better positioned to assess the parties' arguments. The Court thus denies Plaintiff's request for a summary-judgment briefing schedule without prejudice. As the record develops and documents are produced, Plaintiff may renew her request if she believes it appropriate to do so. If Plaintiff chooses to renew her request prior to the end of the scheduled productions, she should indicate in her request why she believes the issues on which she seeks partial summary judgment are not likely to be implicated by the documents that have not yet been produced, and as further set forth herein. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 5/7/2018) (ras) Modified on 5/7/2018 (ras). (Entered: 05/07/2018)
07/27/2018	<u>19</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Andrew Edward Krause on behalf of Federal Bureau Of Investigation. (Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 07/27/2018)
12/27/2018	<u>20</u>	STANDING ORDER M10-468 The United States Attorney's Office shall notify the Court immediately upon the restoration of Department of Justice funding. (As further set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 12/27/2018) (ks) (Entered: 01/02/2019)
12/27/2018		<b>***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number <u>22</u> STANDING ORDER M10-468. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (yv)</b> (Entered: 01/07/2019)
12/27/2018		Case Stayed (yv) (Entered: 01/15/2019)
01/02/2019	<u>21</u>	ORDER: The parties shall submit a joint letter to the Court no later than January 16, 2019, updating the Court on the status of the case. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 1/2/2019) (kv) (Entered: 01/02/2019)

01/15/2019	<u>22</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from William A. Friedman and David S. Jones dated January 15, 2019 re: Status Report. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci.(Friedman, William) (Entered: 01/15/2019)
01/16/2019	<u>23</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>22</u> Letter filed by Lisa Ramaci. ENDORSEMENT: APPLICATION GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 1/16/2019) (ks) (Entered: 01/16/2019)
03/01/2019	<u>24</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from William A. Friedman and Andrew E. Krause dated March 1, 2019 re: Status Report and Proposed Briefing Schedule. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci.(Friedman, William) (Entered: 03/01/2019)
03/04/2019	<u>25</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>24</u> Letter filed by Lisa Ramaci. ENDORSEMENT: APPLICATION GRANTED. (Motions due by 5/1/2019. Cross Motions due by 6/5/2019. Responses due by 7/3/2019. Replies due by 7/31/2019.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 3/4/2019) (jwh) (Entered: 03/05/2019)
04/23/2019	<u>26</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time for Defendant to file its motion for summary judgment addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Andrew E. Krause dated April 23, 2019. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation.(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 04/23/2019)
04/24/2019	<u>27</u>	ORDER granting <u>26</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time for Defendant to file its motion for summary judgment. APPLICATION GRANTED SO ORDERED. (Cross Motions due by 6/14/2019, Motions due by 5/15/2019.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 4/24/2019) (jca) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
04/24/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 7/12/2019, Replies due by 8/9/2019. (jca) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
05/15/2019	<u>28</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation. Responses due by 6/14/2019(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 05/15/2019)
05/15/2019	<u>29</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>28</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation. (Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 05/15/2019)
05/15/2019	<u>30</u>	DECLARATION of David M. Hardy in Support re: <u>28</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 05/15/2019)
06/10/2019	<u>31</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time for Plaintiff to file her opposition and cross-motion for summary judgment addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from William A. Friedman dated June 10, 2019. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci.(Friedman, William) (Entered: 06/10/2019)
06/10/2019	<u>32</u>	ORDER granting <u>31</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time.Application Granted. So Ordered Cross Motions due by 6/28/2019. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 6/10/2019) (js) (Entered: 06/11/2019)
06/10/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines as to <u>28</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Responses due by 7/28/2019 Replies due by 8/23/2019. (js) (Entered: 06/11/2019)
06/28/2019	<u>33</u>	CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. Responses due by 7/26/2019(Friedman, William) (Entered: 06/28/2019)
06/28/2019	<u>34</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>33</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . and in Opposition to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Friedman, William) (Entered: 06/28/2019)
06/28/2019	<u>35</u>	DECLARATION of William A. Friedman in Support re: <u>33</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16)(Friedman, William) (Entered: 06/28/2019)

07/05/2019	<u>36</u>	MOTION for William A. Friedman to Withdraw as Attorney . Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of William A. Friedman)(Friedman, William) (Entered: 07/05/2019)
07/08/2019	<u>37</u>	MEMO ENDORSED ORDER granting <u>36</u> Motion to Withdraw as Attorney. ENDORSEMENT: APPLICATION GRANTED. SO ORDERED. Attorney William Adam Friedman terminated. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 7/8/2019) (rj) (Entered: 07/09/2019)
07/26/2019	<u>38</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>28</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . and in opposition to Plaintiff's cross-motion for summary judgment (Dkt. No. 33). Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation. (Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 07/26/2019)
08/23/2019	<u>39</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>33</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Radine, Michael) (Entered: 08/23/2019)
02/28/2020	<u>40</u>	ORDER: The Court will hold oral argument as to the pending motions on March 5, 2020, at 11:00 a.m., in Courtroom 1506 at the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, New York 10007. Oral Argument set for 3/5/2020 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 1506, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Ronnie Abrams. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 2/28/2020) (rj) (Entered: 03/02/2020)
03/03/2020	<u>41</u>	ORDER: Upon consent of the parties, the conference scheduled for March 5, 2020 is hereby adjourned to March 6, 2020 at 9:30 a.m. SO ORDERED., ( Oral Argument set for 3/6/2020 at 09:30 AM before Judge Ronnie Abrams.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 3/03/2020) (ama) (Entered: 03/03/2020)
03/06/2020	<u>42</u>	ORDER: As discussed at today's conference, the parties shall file their supplemental submissions no later than April 6, 2020. This action is hereby stayed pending receipt of the supplemental submissions and the Court's ruling on the pending motions. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 3/6/2020) (mro) (Entered: 03/06/2020)
03/06/2020		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ronnie Abrams: Oral Argument held on 3/6/2020 re: <u>28</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation, <u>33</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . filed by Lisa Ramaci. (Court Reporter Rose Prater) (arc) (Entered: 03/06/2020)
03/06/2020		Case Stayed (mro) (Entered: 03/06/2020)
03/30/2020	<u>43</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Andrew E. Krause dated March 30, 2020. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation..(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 03/30/2020)
03/31/2020	<u>44</u>	ORDER granting <u>43</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Andrew E. Krause dated March 30, 2020. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation. Application granted. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 3/31/2020) (rjm) (Entered: 03/31/2020)
04/09/2020	<u>45</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 3/6/2020 before Judge Ronnie Abrams. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Rose Prater, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/30/2020. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/11/2020. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/8/2020..(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/09/2020)
04/09/2020	<u>46</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 3/6/2020 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days....(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/09/2020)

04/30/2020	<u>47</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation..(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 04/30/2020)
05/15/2020	<u>48</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Andrew E. Krause dated May 15, 2020. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation..(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 05/15/2020)
05/18/2020	<u>49</u>	ORDER granting <u>48</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time: Application granted. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 5/18/2020) (jwh) (Entered: 05/18/2020)
07/01/2020	<u>50</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Andrew E. Krause dated July 1, 2020 re: two logistical items in connection with the upcoming July 6, 2020 filing deadline. Document filed by Federal Bureau Of Investigation..(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 07/01/2020)